



## **Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel**

### **Quarterly Public Hearing with the Chief Minister**

**THURSDAY, 28th NOVEMBER 2013**

**Panel:**

Senator S.C. Ferguson (Chairman)  
Deputy J.G. Reed of St. Ouen (Vice Chairman)  
Deputy R.J. Rondel of St. Helier

**Witnesses:**

Senator I.J. Gorst (The Chief Minister)  
Senator P.F. Routier MBE (The Assistant Chief Minister)  
Deputy A.K.F. Green MBE (The Minister for Housing)  
Mr. J. Richardson (Chief Executive Officer)  
Mr. P. Bradbury (Director, Corporate Policy)

**Topics Discussed:**

- |  |                     |
|--|---------------------|
| 1. Modernisation Programme                   | Page 2              |
| 2. Population and Migration / Long-Term Plan | Pages 11, 35 and 45 |
| 3. Public Sector Pensions                    | Page 25             |
| 4. Freedom of Information                    | Page 25             |
| 5. Strategic Housing Unit                    | Page 30             |
| 6. Co-ordination of Policy                   | Page 35             |
| 7. Access to Justice                         | Page 41             |
| 8. Liquid Waste Project                      | Page 42             |

[10:01]

**Senator S.C. Ferguson (Chairman):**

Welcome to this quarterly public hearing of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel relating to the Chief Minister's Department. I wonder, Chief Minister, if you could say who you are and what your position is for the purposes of transcription. Super. Right. Modernisation programme. What progress have you made since we last met?

**The Chief Minister:**

Good question. Trying to think that these seem to come round fairly quickly. I think that is because the last one we had to defer it, did we not? So it is only literally a couple of months. Having said all that, I think we have certainly made some good progress on the workforce modernisation side of things. We have got to a good place with the trade unions in collective partnership working as I said when I announced the States Employment Board's decision to approve the final year of the 3-year pay deal. The meeting that I had with union representatives was extremely positive to such a point that I think they accept that we are in a position which is unprecedented when it comes to employee and employer relationships there. Completely engaged, they recognise that it is only through engagement that they will be able to help to form the future terms and conditions which is exactly what we want, because we need to engage with them to complete that string of work. We are well advanced in a number of areas there again, as I said in the States last week. So that is going well. The e-government stream: KPMG, as we said last time we met, were just about to start their work on that particular area. That is progressing well and they all...

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

What are they doing on it?

**The Chief Minister:**

They are taking the work that was done with regard to mapping and then looking at the design of which bits can become digital and looking at what the cost of that might be. As I understand it, they are already coming up with some good ideas there. At the same time, Social Security are working well and they have initiated a number of e-initiatives. Health and Social Services are going great steam ahead with their Lean and efficiency programmes and again I spoke of that to a couple of those in the States last week. We continue training of people into Lean. You will be aware that we however, perhaps on the downside, have lost the Director of H.R. (Human Resources), who was also in effect acting as programme director, and we are also to be losing at the end of this year Dr. Robert Crawford. So therefore we are in the process of looking at the structure there which Dr. Crawford has helped develop with John, and the general consensus of

Dr. Crawford, John and the Corporate Management Board is that the system can continue to work because we have gained that point of momentum.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

On those specific arrangements, Chief Minister, people were brought in to specifically undertake and help in the modernisation programme. Are you concerned that you have staff leaving in this respect, and why might that be so? Is it because of disagreements with the policy or...?

**The Chief Minister:**

No, and I am not concerned. It is always disappointing to lose someone, but both individuals have come in, made us think about the service we provide in a different way and given a really great start. I think perhaps you will be speaking at some point to Dr. Crawford and he, I do not think he would mind me saying, says although he is not leaving yet, he thinks that he leaves the reform programme in a good place; that it has gained such momentum and the structure now in place means that it will deliver what we want it to deliver.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Yes, but you do not have people of the same calibre to carry it through, have you? One of them is a Ph.D. (Doctor of Philosophy) from Harvard; the other one is an M.B.A. (Master of Business Administration). You know, these are the people that you need to carry it through, and you do not have anybody in the States with the same level of qualification.

**The Chief Minister:**

Yes, but sometimes people can come in that can kick start a programme. They can inspire others with the vision that they have for change, and do not forget the change programme is being politically led as well. It is the Council of Ministers that wanted this programme to take place, that are currently ensuring that it does take place. So I do not think that it...

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

How many on the Council of Ministers have got a tertiary degree?

**The Chief Minister:**

Why is that particularly...just because somebody may not have a tertiary degree does not mean to say that they have not bought into the vision and the strategy and the programme which those individuals that you rightly respect have set out and laid out for the delivery of the reform programme.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

If you do not have people with the educational background who are you going to get to lead it? This is the real problem. You know, we are getting good people to work for us and then we get rid of them.

**The Chief Minister:**

We are not getting rid of them. As you know, Dr. Crawford is leaving. First of all, I am not sure that it is right for me to start talking about individuals' employment circumstances in this way, because the difficulty I obviously have is that I have many hats to wear, one of which is that I am Chairman of the States Employment Board which is the employee of the employer. So I cannot and do not really think it is appropriate for me to start talking in public about individuals' specific circumstances for why they might be moving on. But when someone leaves we do need to consider who might be the appropriate person to replace them. We are doing that at the moment. What I think I am trying to say is, I still have confidence that this programme has gained sufficient momentum and will carry on being delivered because there is political will not only in the Council of Ministers, but I know there is strong political will on behalf of your Panel, Chairman, and I know there is strong political will in the Assembly as well. I said from the start, to me not reforming is not an option.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

Is that political will united within the Council of Ministers for the policy moving forward?

**The Chief Minister:**

It is. I have no reason to doubt that it is not. Some Ministers perhaps would like to see the programme sped up and changes made more quickly, but again I think the place that we have got to with the trade union shows that culture partnership working, which we always knew was going to be an important part of this programme, takes time and we do not want to do anything that might hinder that.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Right. Well, when are we likely to see the pay groups reduced from 23 to 4?

**The Chief Minister:**

That takes a while to deliver. Again, we have just spoken about the individuals that started this programme out and they were quite clear from the work that they have done elsewhere that this will take a number of years. The first round of this work in a large group is being undertaken with nurses and they are making good progress on that, and that is part of the wage negotiation. So it is going to take a number of years.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Okay; a number of years. But how many? Twenty, 30?

**The Chief Minister:**

No, no. We are 2013 now; 2014 that work will be mostly undertaken and hopefully brought to completion so that people can be put on to those fewer pay groups during the course of 2015 or by the start of 2015.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Can I ask at that point is it your proposal that all staff will be transferred into the new pay groups?

**The Chief Minister:**

Yes.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Can I also ask, currently do the unions and our employees support the reduction and the changes that are being proposed with regards to the move from 23 pay groups to a much better and smaller number?

**The Chief Minister:**

There will be, I could say, in principle, yes; but obviously this is part of the partnership working that we are going to need to work on and explore, because each pay group might have a different particular issue about where it would want to sit on the new pay spine, and which bits of experience will want to be taken into account. So this is why it is a partnership, negotiated and consultative programme. But we know that. We have been quite clear about where we wanted to get to in that particular regard and as I said, nurses are already working on their particular ones and they are ahead of the others.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Sorry. I suppose the key question is currently are the workforce including the Unions signed up to the reduction in pay groups from the current 23 to 4?

**The Chief Minister:**

They are signed up to the modernisation programme which was what we wanted to deliver.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

I need to press you, Minister. Are they signed up to the...?

**The Chief Minister:**

No, no. Because when you say...you are trying to say that it is like getting a signature on "I am going to do this, this and this." It is much more of a partnership consultative process. We have been clear that the modernisation programme from the start included this reduction in pay groups from the number that we have now to around 4. Now, why do I say I think they are supporting it in principle?

[10:15]

It is because of the work that Paul has been undertaking on the Manual Workers' Joint Council where they have agreed to start having this combined negotiating body. So the big unions have come together and said they want to negotiate together. So they recognise that the future is a different way of operating from the past. That gives me that confidence that they do accept that and that they want to work together with us to deliver.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

But presumably if you are going to be successful at some point you are going to have to gain formal agreement from the workforce to support the changes in terms and conditions.

**The Chief Minister:**

That is right.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

I fully appreciate that you talk about the modernisation programme. However, you previously today have explained that there are all sorts of elements in it and we want to focus on particularly one. So when do you anticipate achieving or reaching formal agreement so that you or the Council of Ministers is able to deliver the changes that have been put forward?

**The Chief Minister:**

As I just said to you, that process will take place during 2014. So we expect that, yes, this is the principle that we are working towards, but there will be all sorts of details to iron out about who might sit where and why and all those sorts of things. It is when they have been ironed out then we will have that formal agreement.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

So you gave the 4 per cent pay rise, but what conditions were attached to that?

**The Chief Minister:**

If you remember what I said in my statement, there were conditions attached to it.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

But how formal are the conditions?

**The Chief Minister:**

They are quite clear from my statement. They are quite clear from a minuted meeting of the States Employment Board.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Yes, but we do not see those minutes.

**The Chief Minister:**

No, but I basically said the same thing in my statement and in a letter which John sent to all staff. So that is about getting the new contract of employment by the beginning of 2014 for all new staff, so that everybody will start on that new contract of employment. If I can remember my testimony from a week ago. Basically a timeline for all the work that we will be undertaking in 2014, which is what you are asking me about now, about the unified pay line. Setting up of (a) a timeline, but also a body of teachers, central H.R. and the Education Department to look and take work on their future. What modernisation will look like for them and how teachers can support education overall - not just their terms and conditions, but they are very keen to be involved in that; and there is another one as well. The criteria to meet the States Employment Board's requirement of 4 per cent which was set out in August.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

The unions responded positively to accepting the 4 per cent with the conditions attached.

**The Chief Minister:**

Yes.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

Those conditions do not affect a lot of people, do they?

**The Chief Minister:**

No, they do; they affect more - and that we would agree the framework for this new negotiating body as well in the collapse of the Manual Workers' Joint Council.

**Assistant Chief Minister:**

Can I just add about the Joint Council if that is the issue? Because the process that we have gone through over the last year, 18 months, has been, I have to say, quite dramatic in the way that they have changed their attitude in the way they are prepared and looking forward to working towards this new negotiation. They are prepared to see that the Manual Workers' Joint Council itself does not exist in the future. It will be through this new structure. They have really made tremendous strides in the way that they are prepared to work with the States Employment Board.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

When are they going to do Lean?

**Assistant Chief Minister:**

What do you mean?

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

There are a lot of restrictive practices in the manual sector, and those are going to be the difficult ones.

**Chief Executive Officer:**

I will separate the restrictive practices from Lean. I do not think they should be joined. Lean is running throughout the whole of the organisation. We have some excellent examples that are now being delivered as we speak in Health, which has affected manual workers, because in catering areas - some superb outcomes. We have Lean workshops being set up which are training staff throughout the whole organisation, including the manuals. The manual workers have very much brought into the concept of it. As they go through that so they will start looking at alternative ways of working and we have full engagement from them in terms of being prepared to deliver it.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Are you sure that it is going down to the front line staff? Because that is not what I am getting back from people.

**Chief Executive Officer:**

Maybe perhaps I ought to meet you, Chair, and we ought to go to the hospital...

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Chairman, if you will excuse me. I am not a piece of furniture. I might look like a Chippendale, but I am not. **[Laughter]**



**Chief Executive Officer:**

Chairman, apology. If you would like to come and see what has happened in a couple of areas I think you will be very surprised.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Yes, I will. Right.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Sorry. You did separate Lean from restrictive practices. How are you dealing with the restricted?

**Chief Executive Officer:**

I do not like the term restrictive practices which is why I do not...we have some fairly old agreements and that is part of the agreement with the unions which they accepted. Not only manual workers; I think all unions accepted that we have to start looking at alternative ways of working and the policies that are being rewritten are addressing those with them. It is being done jointly. I do not like the term and I will not use the term "restrictive practices." I think there are areas where the workforce accepts that we all have to now start looking at alternative ways of working. That is what is being developed as part of the workforce modernisation and all of the policies are in place.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Things like the on call were always...they might be called out for 20 minutes but what they put in for was significantly more in terms of time and a half, or double time on Sundays.

**Chief Executive Officer:**

It is more than that because we have different agreements in one sector of the workforce to another sector. So there is something about levelling out to make sure we have a common area and stand-by callout is one which has 7 or 8 different systems. We need to have one that properly recompenses people for out-of-hours availability and coming out on call, but there has to be some uniformity across the organisation, and the staff accept that. So we are working towards that to as part of the agreement.

**The Chief Minister:**

Could I just add that at the front line because it is important if there are areas you are hearing that it is not happening, because the 2 examples that I spoke about in the States were the hospital which is very much frontline and it is the staff there delivering that change; and the other was the emergency department and it was there that nurses basically came up with this idea from a Lean programme of how to deliver their service differently. They were 2 examples which were very

much frontline. So if it is not filtering down everywhere then we need to make sure it is. I could take you to a visit to Social Security and you will see numerous examples in Social Security...

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

We have a meeting with them and of course we had the leading exponent of Lean in the U.K. (United Kingdom) over for a hearing 5 years ago when I had the chance to introduce the Chief Minister to him.

**The Chief Minister:**

We are just slave followers, Chairman, and you know that.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

He still has the offer for a seminar for senior people; it is still on the table but nobody has bothered to take it up. Anyway, right, James.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Just one more thing. When do you anticipate discussions taking place and agreement being reached for the 2015 pay award?

**The Chief Minister:**

That is a good question. It is in the M.T.F.P. (Medium Term Financial Plan) as a percentage. No doubt during the course of next year we will have to start discussions about that as well. But I have not started to think about that yet.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

I think you are right to point to the M.T.F.P. because obviously it is, if you like, a one-year legacy that will be leaving to the next Assembly at the end of our election period. It is only right, I believe, that we make sure that the agreements and the funding that has been allocated is and remains reliable. Is that your intention?

**The Chief Minister:**

It is. My officers will be working to the mandate of monies that the States have given us.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

I accept that you have been working hard to reach agreement for 2012, 2013 and 2014. When would you anticipate being able to announce agreement for the 2015 pay award?

**The Chief Minister:**

I cannot say because I do not know.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

Would you hope it would be before the elections?

**The Chief Minister:**

If history is anything to go by, it would indicate that it would not be. That generally agreement is not reached until well into a pay year that you are trying to reach agreement about. It would be nice to think that it would be, but if we look at history it would tell me that that is not the case.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

When do you expect the e-government to be up and running properly?

**Chief Executive Officer:**

The business case is due from KPMG at the middle of December before the Christmas break. The aim is that that is probably going through governance and control process with delivery starting certainly in the early part of 2014, being rolled out in 2014. So the main areas probably where we will start will be in Social Security, proof of concept Social Security, because they have so much contact with the public is a good place to start and the projects as they start coming out will be tested in Social Security and then rolled out across the organisation. So the early part of 2014 is the answer.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Okay. James.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

I have various issues...

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

We will skip that and just go on to population for now, if that is okay. The latest timetable you provided to the Panel confirms that you intend to lodge the Interim Population Policy next week, in fact to debate in February 2014. Does this timescale still stand?

**Assistant Chief Minister:**

No, it does not.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Why not?

**Assistant Chief Minister:**

Because we have not completed the work or prepared that debate. I think we also recognise your request to have more time as well. But we need to work on a new timescale. Yesterday at the Council of Ministers we looked at the draft Interim Population Policy, or the basis of one. We did not look at what will be presented to the States and to services yet. What we would like to offer you is the opportunity to perhaps have the same presentation that was given to the Council of Ministers yesterday, perhaps in the next few weeks, so that we can show you our thinking and what the Council of Ministers is thinking.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

It is a bit disappointing because we had sort of highlighted the fact that we felt it would be delayed or take longer than first envisaged. I think the Panel wrote to you on 31st October asking for an update and we have not received any information until this morning, what you are telling us, and I wondered why.

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

We wrote on 25th October to outline what the Interim Population Policy was proposed to contain and we gave you that deadline of 2nd December. The intention was, the Chairman asked as to why, that we would step through 2 Council of Ministers' meetings in November, mid-November and the end of November. In fact the first Council of Ministers' meeting that I was ready to take a presentation to was yesterday. So we will go to the next Council of Ministers on 18th December and I am hopeful in terms of what we learnt and the feedback we received yesterday that we can go back to the Council of the 18th with a product that they can have some confidence with. Obviously I need the assurance of the Council of Ministers before we can bring it forward. But that is our current timeline.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

It just would have been nice to have had an update to put into our planning schedule.

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

I appreciate that, but in the letter you asked for more information on the Interim Population Policy.

[10:30]

In fact I needed to step through the Council of Ministers before I was able to provide that.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

It is just we have not received a reply either way. You mention it was discussed yesterday at the Council of Ministers. How was that discussed? Were you in agreement that it moves forward or...?

**Assistant Chief Minister:**

It was a general discussion about the format of what can be brought forward. I think as Paul was saying, we need to have another bash at it in a fortnight's time to settle on the way we want to progress it.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

What are the concerns, then? If it was on the agenda yesterday you probably felt that you were going to come to a conclusion.

**Assistant Chief Minister:**

No, we did not. We thought it was a 2-step approach because, as Paul said at the outset, it was going to be discussed over 2 meetings. To me I think it just helps us; what was discussed yesterday gives confidence with Paul to come forward with a more definite document for the Council of Ministers to...

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

Are you able to share with us what was discussed?

**Assistant Chief Minister:**

That was what I was offering to do. We are quite happy to give you a presentation. It might take a little while.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

It was a long meeting then?

**Assistant Chief Minister:**

Well, it is an important topic. If you want we would be very happy to spend a couple of hours with you going through what was discussed yesterday or whether it would be better after we have discussed it in a fortnight's time, whichever way suits yourselves really.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

Are the Council of Ministers united in that approach?

**The Chief Minister:**

I think we had a, shall I use the diplomatic term, full and frank discussion. There was some disappointment expressed that we needed to have an interim policy and that we were not just waiting for the bigger 2035 policy with more information. Others recognised that we had given a commitment and it is only right that there is a policy, even if it is only for a couple of years while the big piece of work gets completed. Then there were questions about does that mean we need to change very much or do we just stay with where we are? We know that departments are already working on planning assumptions for their big projects so do we need to have a planning assumption in this interim policy around a number per year as a planning assumption? The issues of does the current law deal - I use the word equally but you might use fairly across sectors and how do you control, I am going to use the old terms now, qualified and non qualified within a sector or across a sector and they were some of the big picture discussions that we had. As you would expect, there are no easy answers but we need to try and develop some proposals from that first session which will fit into the interim policy.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Yes, but given the public interest and the public concern, we see the particular concern in the U.K., we see the problems with the extra people coming into the EU, I have in fact seen at least one car with a registration number from one of the problem countries already over here, is it not an area where there should be a little more concentration to get something out? To give the public some confidence that we have it.

**The Chief Minister:**

That is why, as I said, although there was some dissatisfaction expressed with an interim policy, I think the general acceptance was that we had to do that for the very reasons that you have outlined, Chairman.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

Could you just give us an estimated timeline, revised timeline on what you propose to do to take it forward to the next Council of Ministers meeting?

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

We are 24 hours on from the discussion yesterday, I do need absorb it somewhat but we will be going back to Council on 18th December. I am hopeful when I have absorbed the feedback I got yesterday that I can go to the 18th December with a document that Council can have satisfaction with. If that is the case we can move to lodging as soon as possible. Bearing in mind 18th December is immediately before Christmas, I would be hoping towards the end of the year, early

new year. But the Council need to step through this important policy area and need to be satisfied. So, as an officer, I give you the best confidence I can.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

Do you feel that the Council are satisfied that they are able to do that for the next Council of Ministers' Meeting?

**The Chief Minister:**

As Paul said, it is 24 hours since that...well, it is not 24 hours since that discussion, is it? So he needs to try and think about all the things that were said, he will then come back to Paul initially and they will think about what is in the policy, they will then no doubt come to me and we will see if it is ready for the 18th. I suspect that it will be.

**Assistant Chief Minister:**

Can I please try and give a bit of assurance that it is not something that is just sitting there and nothing is happening. We are currently administering the law very carefully. We recognise there are people concerned about issues with regards to population and from this meeting I am going to, as the Chief Minister described, a H.A.W.A.G. (Housing and Work Advisory Group) meeting to look at applications for people who are wanting licences. The way we are operating currently is we have said there is a big concern about people coming to the Island and we have to make judgments on each of the business cases which are put forward to us. We are at the moment being very, very tight and very, very careful. Until we have the interim population debate, are we doing the right thing? I need to know that. I need to know the States are supportive of being quite tight on applications.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

Sorry to press you, when do you think the debate would take place if your timescale...

**Assistant Chief Minister:**

We have to allow time for yourselves as well, have we not?

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

Yes.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

When are you lodging?

**The Chief Minister:**

When do you think...

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

When do you want to lodge?

**The Chief Minister:**

When would we like to lodge?

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

If we get to the Council of Ministers on 18th and they are happy, I would hope to be lodging realistically the first week in January.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

So debate...

**The Chief Minister:**

But then you need to think about...you will need to look at it and think about how long you want to take to consider it. The minimum would be 6 weeks but I suspect you might want longer than that to consider it.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

I just want to remind you, perhaps, Chief Minister, one of the major priorities that was contained in the strategic plan was to address the population-migration issues. You gave commitments that as soon as the census results were analysed then a public debate would take place around population and consultation would be included. Then obviously the States would consider that. A date was given of July 2030. Why is the case that we have not, you have not, progressed this priority as described?

**The Chief Minister:**

We have progressed that priority and, as you know, there are a number of very good reasons why it might not have been delivered in quite the way that we initially thought it could have been prior to the census numbers being available. That priority sits alongside a long-term planning priority and as soon as we started looking at both of those priorities it became apparent that you could not really have a long-term population policy and have that big debate outside of the long-term planning debate, which is why some Ministers yesterday were still concerned that we were even thinking about having an interim policy because they better sit together. But I accept the arguments that the Chairman put forward that we do need to do something in the short term. So



rather than trying to do something that was out of sync with the long-term planning and the long-term population, we have come forward with the idea of the interim population policy. But equally I would say that as Senator Routier has just said, we are already delivering a tightening up of the licences as we said we would in that priority we have been doing, to such an extent that a number of States Members are making representations to the H.A.W.A.G. saying that we are being too tight. So it might be that when we come to discuss our interim population policy we are told that we are now being too tight on immigration. So these issues are difficult for us. Be in no doubt, has it been a priority, yes it has, we have already tightened up, we are already - Paul, Andrew, Alan - delivering on the way that we said we would in that particular strategic plan priority.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

So obviously you have dismissed the idea of including the public in any discussion and consulting...

**The Chief Minister:**

No, we have not. No, no.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Well, that is the commitment that you gave.

**The Chief Minister:**

No, we have not done that at all.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

So when will that happen then? From what you have just said it is going to happen within this tenure of the Council of Ministers.

**The Chief Minister:**

No, that is not right. I have said that we would put together the long-term population policy and the long-term vision and probably will start consultation and publication of that vision...I cannot just exactly remember the date off the top of my head.

**Chief Executive Officer:**

Late spring, early summer. It has to be this side of elections obviously.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

So we are going to have a major consultation and a subsequent debate on the long-term plan in an election year? Is that what you are saying?

**The Chief Minister:**

Whether we have a subsequent debate on the long-term plan during the course of next year, I am not sure that we will but we certainly will start it and have a public consultation on it, yes. We absolutely have to.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Are you now saying that the long-term plan is directly linked to determining a population policy?

**The Chief Minister:**

For the long term. If you stop and think about it, it cannot be anything else, can it? Population is an important factor in what Jersey will look like into the future and what sort of Jersey we want.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

So why did the Council of Ministers not come to that conclusion at the very beginning? Why has it taken so long to get to that view?

**The Chief Minister:**

It has not taken, you say, so long. We have been saying this to you for...and I know that Paul has been saying it for a number of our last updates.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

But Council of Ministers, this is your Strategic Plan, is it not that the States agreed?

**The Chief Minister:**

The States Strategic Plan, yes.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Right, in the Strategic Plan you set out your vision. You are now telling us that that vision has been adjusted.

**The Chief Minister:**

We are delivering on that vision and I have just explained to you exactly how we are doing that.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Maybe you can point us to where it mentions, under managing population growth and migration, any mention of and link to a long-term plan, because I have read it and ...

**The Chief Minister:**

So are you telling me that your Panel does not think they are linked?

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

No, what you are saying is that you are meeting this priority. This priority is quite clear, key actions...

**The Chief Minister:**

Week in, week in...

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

I am not suggesting that you have not met all the actions but...

**The Chief Minister:**

No, I am not saying I have met them all...

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

But the main one, the main issue is population growth.

**The Chief Minister:**

Week in, week out my Ministers are meeting that priority. I am saying to you in a way that some States Members are now finding is too restrictive. So we cannot have it both ways.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Minister, it is not a case of having it both ways. You have got an Assistant Chief Minister in a position where he does not know what to do because there is no full agreement by the States about exactly what the policy is. He has just said that.

**The Chief Minister:**

Could you just pass me the Strategic Plan, please? Although it is an important document I am afraid I do not have it about my person at all times.

[10:45]

“In the meantime we will only grant permissions for new migrants to work where it is compellingly demonstrated that this will deliver sizeable economic or social value and locally qualified people are not available. Other permissions for new migrants will not be granted and we will instead

support employers in recruiting and developing the increasing number of locally qualified job seekers through the Back to Work programme...”

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

That is a short-term measure, Chief Minister.

**The Chief Minister:**

No, it is not a short-term measure.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

It is because a key action is to come back to the States and include...

**The Chief Minister:**

We are delivering on that priority...

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

...the public...

**The Chief Minister:**

...week in, week out.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

That is a short-term measure and it is wrong for you to focus on that and suggest that your priorities are being met because you happen to be closely monitoring or better monitoring, should I say, in dealing with applications for new licences. That is a poor excuse for bringing a population issue to the public and to the States for debate.

**Assistant Chief Minister:**

Are you saying we should not be doing it?

**The Chief Minister:**

We are delivering on this policy. We are coming forward with an interim policy and contrary to your assertions earlier, Deputy, about the no mention of long-term planning having anything to do with population, you will see in your copy of the Strategic Plan it says: “The impact of population pressures and predicted drop in the working age population need to be assessed against the need to maintain a strong economy.” So it was already flagged up in the strategic plan that they were interlinked.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

So the long-term plan is all to do with developing economic growth and not the economic strategy that we have been...

**The Chief Minister:**

Would you like me to read the entire page out, Deputy?

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

If you are looking at economic growth...

**The Chief Minister:**

Because it talks about all the other issues involved in long-term planning.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Yes, if you are looking at economic growth what are you actually doing in the way of productivity of the States and measuring it, and looking at the cost benefit of the modernisation programme with the regard to the improvements in productivity?

**The Chief Minister:**

Yes, that is a very good question. There are 2 bits to it. Looking at productivity right across the economy, we discussed that yesterday in our deliberations and it is an important factor from an economic advice point of view that needs to be a fairly critical part of delivering a successful economy into the future. So we asked for more information in that regard. When it comes to productivity of modernisation and looking at the States more generally, something that we probably think of is benefits realisation which is not just money but also productivity, so it needs to look at them both.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

We will get the productivity gain and the money falls into place.

**The Chief Minister:**

Well, exactly. That is something that I, over the last few months, have focused on and have asked, particularly those departments where they have been doing lead to focus on and collate in a much more co-ordinated fashion. They started to do that. I have not yet seen the results of it coming out of Health but from conversations that I have had with some of their officers that work is in progress and at an advanced stage. It is something that Social Security, who largely are sort of following on from Health, are very mindful of and we have spoken a lot about, they are doing that

work. It is also something that we discussed when I met with KPMG as well around how they are factoring that into the e-Government work.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

Can you explain who sits on the...you mentioned the Housing and Work Advisory Group, just explain who sits on that and whether they are in agreement and signed off, that group, to the policy we are looking at?

**Assistant Chief Minister:**

The people who sit on the Housing and Work Advisory Group are myself, I chair it, and it is the Minister for Economic Development, the Minister for Housing, the Assistant Minister for Social Security.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

Have they signed off in agreement with...

**Assistant Chief Minister:**

I would not want to speak for the Minister for Housing.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

As a group?

**The Minister for Housing:**

Speaking for myself, yes, and I believe the group is at one. But you would have to ask each individual. We work very well together, we have the same objectives, we individually assess different applications and virtually every time come up with the same answer when we get together so, yes.

**Assistant Chief Minister:**

It is a good balance because there is the Housing needs, the Economic needs and Social Security, which are very good at giving us information about the availability in the work force of people who are looking for work. That is an important factor for us when we are making decisions. If there are people already in the Island who can do a particular job, sweet. We take great cognisance of what the Social Security Department tell us on each application. They give us feedback on whether employers have been engaging with them or not, they have got the Back to Work team.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

Would you be able to provide the Panel with numbers and figures of how many new applications you might have issued?

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

We can.

**Assistant Chief Minister:**

Yes, we can do that. We do that on a fairly regular basis.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

Yes, okay, just for information purposes. So, just to be clear, last one on population, if things go according to plan it probably will not be until March, April next year that we will debate...

**Assistant Chief Minister:**

Yes, it really depends on what...I would like to make sure you have enough time to do what you want to do in the way of reviewing it. So we are going to hopefully lodge it in January time, so it is a matter of...we want it to work for you, to give you sufficient time.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

So March, April next year.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

It might that maybe it is not...

**Assistant Chief Minister:**

We can put pressure on you if you like. **[Laughter]**

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

It might be the case that if the Council of Ministers has chosen not to consult with the public, maybe Scrutiny will.

**The Chief Minister:**

That is fine.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

The long-term plan will come out about the same time?

**Chief Executive Officer:**

The framework for the plan certainly needs to be with it but it is going to have to come out at around that time, certainly this side of the summer recess.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

So you say around that time, is that before or after? Because obviously that may have...because of the direct link that the Chief Minister has just explained between the interim population policy and the long-term plan, it is likely that this Scrutiny Panel is going to have to consider both because they are, as you quote, a direct link.

**The Chief Minister:**

Well, I said that the long-term population policy is directly linked with the long-term planning and into the intervening period we are coming forward with the interim policy but Paul's probably a bit nearer to the operational level of where we are.

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

Long-term population policy should be part of the long-term plan. The long-term plan is a very significant piece of work that needs public consultation and engagement, it will take time, therefore we should do an interim population policy in the meantime. Interim population policy January, there is a States Members' briefing that has been arranged in January also on the framework of the long-term vision which will set out a timetable. That timetable, to my understanding at present is not the first half of 2014, it is second half, it not the first half of 2015.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Yes, but surely the long-term plan...we had the briefing on it but is it not better to have the sort of long-term plan that the New Zealanders have?

**The Chief Minister:**

Yes.

**Assistant Chief Minister:**

Exactly.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Which is not what ours is looking like.



**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

I think it would be extremely helpful for this Panel that, as soon as possible, you respond to the questions we have raised, you provide us with a new timetable of what you are proposing and then, and only then, will we be able to determine what part we can play in reviewing this important subject. I think that would be extremely helpful and be very clear. Please do not deceive us with regard to the time scale. We already have found that delays have happened and we appreciate that they can happen, but it is important, as I say, that we do give a very clear steer and we are provided - and I hasten add I stress "provided" - with all relevant information well in advance and in fact actually when we require it because that will delay review.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Yes, because it has been going on for 5 or 6 years now, I think.

**The Chief Minister:**

I am pleased it is not just my... [Laughter]

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

One small thing before we get on to Freedom of Information, in the U.K. if your pension savings are worth more than £1.5 million or £1.25 million from 6th April 2014, you have to pay a lifetime allowance tax charge on the excess. What steps are you taking to follow a similar regime in Jersey?

**The Chief Minister:**

I am not aware that we are taking any but I shall certainly check with the Income Tax Department and Treasury to see whether they are intending to follow suit. Off the top of my head I do not know how many individuals there might be in Jersey with such pension arrangements.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Well, I think perhaps it would be interesting to know the statistics of it and so on. Right, now Freedom of Information, how is that coming along?

**The Chief Minister:**

I will pass that to John.

**Chief Executive Officer:**

Right, thank you. We have a fairly large project being set up, which is cross-departmental. We have just allocated or the Council of Ministers agreed funding or implementation, which I think you were aware of, and we are just in the process of resourcing that with temporary contract staff to

make sure that certainly those departments who would have a much larger requirement for data analysis, records management, who from U.K. experience are the ones who are probably more likely to be asked for information under the law, will have appropriate controls in place to be able to answer those questions.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

It is coming in in January, I think, is it not?

**Chief Executive Officer:**

Yes, that work is planned for 2014 and the focus is on making sure that all of the old historical records are properly managed so that as information requests come in from January when the law is due to come into place obviously departments will be structured and geared up to provide that information. There are a couple of changes that have been identified that will be required for the legislation and our team is working hand in hand with the Law Officers' Department and the law draftsmen to make necessary changes. That is the current status of where we are. Vacancies were advertised, I think 2 or 3 weeks ago I saw the advert go out so the aim is that quite a lot of staff who are currently in the organisation will be looking to fill some of those vacancies and then we can backfill so we just make sure that we have got the right level of resource in the right place to provide that support to departments.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

What bits of legislation do we need to change?

**Chief Executive Officer:**

There are a couple of small changes to the F.O.I. (Freedom of Information) law that we identified need to be amended and then there are regulations that need to be brought in.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

What changes?

**Chief Executive Officer:**

I have not got them here but there are...

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Well, perhaps you would let us know?

**Chief Executive Officer:**

I can let you know the changes, definitely, yes.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

What is the timescale at the moment for the law draftsmen in terms of their workload?

**Chief Executive Officer:**

They are aware of it and they are working with the legal team from the Law Officers' Department to do the drafting that is required so that that can be brought in as quickly as possible.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

So the £4.2 million is being used to pay a team to...

**Chief Executive Officer:**

It is partly additional resource and it is partly then looking at the systems we have got to ensure that we have a common approach to data management and file storage for the future.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Why has it taken so long to get around to it?

**Chief Executive Officer:**

Purely timing to get the funding in place and to get the resource required to deliver on it.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Can I ask, when will all States Departments be compliant with the law?

**The Chief Minister:**

Well, the proposal is that it will be...

**Chief Executive Officer:**

They will have to comply with the law from January 2015.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

January?

**Chief Executive Officer:**

January 2015 when the law comes in to place.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

How much training are the staff going to get?

**Chief Executive Officer:**

That is part of the work for delivery in 2014.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

It is quite interesting the protective way that people in Health look after one's X-rays. "You cannot look at them." "Yes, I can, they are mine."

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Are you confident that all departments will be compliant in January 2015?

**The Chief Minister:**

We have given the commitment, we have put the funding in place but it is a big piece of work and I think that is what you are driving at, with the resource, with the political commitment, then I think we will be.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Are there any other matters that need to be dealt with to support the delivery and the compliance with the Freedom of Information Law that have not been provided for at the moment?

[11:00]

**The Chief Minister:**

There are some issues which John has spoken about with regard to a need to make some amendments to law changes. There is the question of exactly what will be in scope on day one but they are more operational details which you might welcome having a briefing from...what is the person who is the person now that is going...

**Chief Executive Officer:**

Our project manager but I would certainly be happy to give you a more detailed briefing if it will help with being project manager in the...

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Thank you. We will take you up on that. My questions arises from the fact that there was a comment by the head of the archive property who was...there is an additional need for storage as information gets registered within that building. Again, what plans are in train to deal with the concerns that were raised?

**Chief Executive Officer:**

Certainly in terms of data storage we have got to look at far more active ways of digital storage for the future otherwise we will be looking at large extensions to building, which is just not the ideal in this time and this age. So part of the work that we have got to do, and it is absolutely critical, is that wherever possible, as data is then checked and records are retained under the retention schedules, as much as possible is then converted to digital format and stored in appropriate means so we do not have to build large extensions to buildings. Inevitably there is a requirement to store more data, store it in a more structured way than perhaps it has been in the past, and we can all recognise that but we should be looking to move to a world of digital storage as opposed to physical storage wherever possible.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Can I ask a final question on this matter? You say that a sum of money of £4.287 million has been allocated, will this fund the digital retention and copy of records that you just spoke about?

**Chief Executive Officer:**

Part of the work which I thought I brought last time, that I said would be part of the briefing, is there are several strands. One is look at the physical records you have got and then...

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Can you just answer the question: is it all covered or not?

**Chief Executive Officer:**

Part of it is in the records management piece, which is about electronic storage.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Right, so part of it but part of it is not. So there is still additional funding that is required to meet the...

**Chief Executive Officer:**

No, I did not say that, no. I did not say that, please. What I said was part of the work we have got to do is sift out of physical records, making sure they are then retained in the retention schedule and then part of the work that is being done as this 2014 delivery programme is to ensure we have got a proper records management which is the electronic bit in place and then we have to migrate all that information across. When it all comes in January 2015, will we have all of that material sifted and then stored electronically? Probably not, because it will take a long while to get there, there is so much to do, but we do need to make sure that we have properly constructed retention schedule so that as we do get requests for information then there is a proper protocol that is

followed in extracting that information. In the early days I suspect it will have to be extracted manually, which will be time consuming, but as we move from physical manual records to electronic storage, we have to make sure the protocols are right and the structure is right of that digital storage system so that information can be accessed properly.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

So, final question, are you confident, Chief Minister, that the sum of money allocated for central contingency to allow for the implementing of the law will deal with all the matters that your Chief Officer has just spoken about, and allow that process to be carried out?

**The Chief Minister:**

Yes, I am. I would hope that we might even be able to come in under budget.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

We understand that the Strategic Housing Unit has now been fully established within your department.

**The Chief Minister:**

No, the States changed their mind and decided it should be fully established...well...

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Yes, you were going to organise it.

**The Chief Minister:**

Yes, it will sit in my department but it will be within the remit of the new Minister for Housing, which is why I brought the new Minister for Housing with me.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

The question is, Chief Minister, what work has been undertaken to transfer overall responsibility for the strategic housing unit to the Minister for Housing.

**The Chief Minister:**

He is already in situ. He sits down the corridor from me but I do not know if Andrew wants to...

**The Minister for Housing:**

Apart from physically moving my office to be within the Chief Minister's Department, I have officers now on loan because we do intend to recruit properly but I wanted to get on with the work. I have got officers on loan from Planning and Environment and from International Affairs, up on the next

floor, 2 officers working with the Director of Policy, working on the strategic housing progress, working with the Cambridge Centre for Housing, Professor Whitehead, and we are carrying out an analysis of supply and demand for housing, including household formation rates. But when I say all this, we are looking at housing as a whole now. Previously the main role of the Minister for Housing, although in some ways he was accountable for what went on, he was responsible without the accountability, if you know what I am trying to say. The previous role of the Minister for Housing was really around social housing. My role is around housing across all tenures and that is what we are working on. But we have got to understand what housing affordability is. We keep talking about what housing affordability is and affordable homes and everything, but what is it? Who can afford, who cannot afford, what can we do? All that work is going on at the present time.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

People have been asking that for...

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Yes, but presumably you have to work closely with the Planning Department?

**The Minister for Housing:**

Exactly, I have formed an advisory group, the Strategic Housing Advisory Group and that consists of the Minister for Planning, myself, the Minister for Treasury and Resources and the Minister for Social Security at the present time.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

What about the basic economics of it? For instance subsidies on housing, particularly in the private sector, distort the market. Now, where is the auxiliary report that you should be getting on that? You do not mention economics.

**The Minister for Housing:**

No, I have not got that far yet, except that when we decided to bring in the deposit scheme for purchase of homes as distinct from the deposit scheme or tenant's protection, we took advice from the Economic Advisor's office. That advice was sound and correct and advised us on the way forward. In fact that deposit scheme has achieved all the objectives we wanted it to achieve. It has got people into their homes, it has had no effect, and that is not just me saying that, all the estate agents - because I met with them a fortnight ago - said it has had no effect on the price of housing which was a concern we were going to cause a bubble. In fact they actually said it has had the opposite, it has had a slight affect down rather than up. So we do take economic advice...

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

I hope we can hold you to that, Minister for Housing.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

Can I just ask, on the group you mentioned that was set up, how many occasions have you met?

**The Minister for Housing:**

As a group we...

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

Minister, can I talk about it? The Strategic Housing Unit has been set up and is being set up out of P.33. We have clearly picked up a lot of - I use this in a positive way - legacy work, so there is a lot of ongoing policy work at the moment. We have the regulation of social housing, we are developing a report and proposition as the Housing Panel asked us to for the deposit loan scheme we are running but also we have initiated some new work. So we have initiated a housing strategy from the Centre for Planning and Housing Policy at Cambridge. We are doing that, we are physically sat in the same room as the Economic Advisor, and I have asked the Economic Advisor to include in his business plan for next year a review of housing policies and their impact on the supply and demand for housing in Jersey. So the Economic Advisor is thinking about his capability and his capacity and he will frame that work next year. So there is forward planning work. There is a strategy, there is a piece of economic work that I have asked for and we have our first meeting of the political group which we are setting up for December.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

Sorry, can you just explain that political group, is that the one you...

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

Yes, okay, that is the political...

**The Minister for Housing:**

That is the one I referred to.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

So they have not met yet?

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

No, so the process of that political group is first meeting to look at the legacy work, to look at the forward work with commissioning, to look at the terms of reference. If it is then satisfied with its



terms of reference, take those terms of reference to Council of Ministers and the Council of Ministers will then, I would expect, sign off. The P.33 did not talk about an advisory group, it talked about a Minister for Housing leading the Strategic Housing Unit. That is what we have been doing but we have obviously also taken the view the best way to do that is in a corporate manner. So the Minister for Housing has taken a view that he should invite his colleagues to advise him on the progress of the strategic housing unit, Planning, Treasury, et cetera. So we are in that transitional phase, yes, but there is a lot of work that we are progressing and that we have initiated.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

Sorry, I do not quite understand the Economic Advisor's role in this. What is...?

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

Well, my view is we have commissioned a strategic piece of work from Cambridge academics, they will pick up on the rounded issues in terms of the economics but I take a view that the States of Jersey has a range of housing policies. I would like the Economic Advisor's view on what impact those housing policies have on housing supply and demand and affordability in Jersey.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

So you have already released the past responsibility for the Strategic Housing Unit to the Minister for Housing, is that correct, Chief Minister? In future any matters to do with the Strategic Housing Unit would not be the responsibility of this Panel?

**The Chief Minister:**

That is a difficult one, is it not, because the Unit actually sits in my department but responsibility for it is the Minister for Housing and I think you would be perfectly entitled to ask questions about it from an operational point of view.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

You suggested the location is not important. Are you saying that location is extremely important and the fact that they based in your department...are you saying because the staff are based in a...

**The Chief Minister:**

No, because my Director of Quality has overall responsibility for delivery of the operational day to day.

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

From my previous role, it is possible to work to support more than one Minister. That is what we used to do in the Population Office, we used to be in the Housing Department, as an

administrative line management I sit within Chief Minister's and report to John, but here is a Minister for Housing, the States Assembly decided that, he is part of the Council of Ministers and he is a member of the Assembly. My view is the Minister for Housing is accountable. I guess the Chief Minister has accountability for all areas in the round.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

So it would be really helpful if you could just identify and describe to us, not now but provide some information about the structure of a new Strategic Housing Unit and the accountability. The lines of accountability and who is responsible. The whole point is to have direct accountability where possible.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Effectively the way you are describing it, you are an Assistant Chief Minister for Housing?

**The Minister for Housing:**

I suppose you could put it that way, except that I have...

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

This is how it is coming across.

**The Minister for Housing:**

Maybe on policy but I still have the role as the Minister for Housing.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Yes, I am not saying you have not, I am just saying this how it is coming across.

**The Chief Minister:**

Let us just say we are trying to work practically with the decision in the States.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Which is always difficult.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Talking about the various policies and strategies in the development and the work that has been going on, and we do acknowledge that work has been going on to deal with many significant matters that we have been aware for such a long time. But I would like to just focus on for a little while on, if you like, the co-ordination of policy. One of the things that you stood up and promoted,

indeed with the Council of Ministers as well, was the need to co-ordinate policy across departments. How do you think you have got on?

**The Chief Minister:**

Policy is co-ordinated in a way like it has never been before and that is one of the things that Paul and his team are doing. Some areas have been difficult, some have been more straightforward as you would expect because what we are trying to do is work within a system of corporation cells with policies that affect more than one of those corporation cells and come to a unified position.

[11:15]

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

So are you saying you are happy and you believe that the co-ordination of policies is far better managed now than in the past?

**The Chief Minister:**

Absolutely it is, but can we do better? Yes, we can.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

I want to challenge you on a number of matters because it seems that various decisions and strategies are being produced in the absence of one key issue being resolved, which is the issue of population and migration. How do you see...why do you believe that on the one hand you can co-ordinate policy but you do not deal with the fundamental matter deciding how many people you are going to provide for.

**The Chief Minister:**

Well, as we have said, and quite clearly said, departments are still working to a planning assumption of immigration of 325.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

You cannot have it both ways, Minister. You say that on the one hand you are following a new population policy and on another that you made a commitment to bring forward a new population policy that the public and obviously Ministers and the States could rely upon. We are debating and we are discussing hospitals, we are now saying we need new schools and so on and so forth, and more houses, and we have yet to answer the key question: how many people are we providing for? You can build a hospital of whatever size you want and agree to a particular sum of money being spent on the hospital, and yet we have got no certainty that that hospital will meet the needs of the Island in the future because we have yet to agree a population policy.

**The Chief Minister:**

I do not agree with you at all. There are many factors around planning for a hospital, which I am sure you will have read about and seen when you looked at the hospital documents or attended a briefing and one of the factors is not...one factor is the overall size of the population or level of immigration but that is only one factor. There are many others as well. So I do not think that your assumption is quite right. But would you expect departments not to be planning for their future and not have a planning assumption, which seems to be inference of your question?

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Are we planning for the same level of population?

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

I suppose the question ultimately is, is it the cart before the horse?

**The Chief Minister:**

No.

**Chief Executive Officer:**

Can I add, I think one of the most important and telling points when you look at planning assumptions is, regardless of population, we do know that over the next 30 years the resident population as it sits today, we would double the number who are going into the plus 65 bracket. Those residents are the ones, as they grow in age, will require more hospital treatment. That is with the population standing still.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

I hear what you are saying...

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

No, wait a minute, James. Can you give me the evidence that they are going to need more procedures? Give me the evidence, because that is not what they are finding in the U.K. They are finding that there is no change in the demand.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Would you confirm...

**The Chief Minister:**

Just a minute, you are asking us to provide you with what are detailed technical medical issues and I do not think you would expect us to have that information...

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

It is not a detailed technical medical issue.

**The Chief Minister:**

I do not think you would expect us to have that information to hand for...

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Well, perhaps you would like to look at it and produce the evidence and I will provide you with the evidence that says quite differently.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

I accept, as your Chief Officer just mentioned, that the people over 65 are going to increase in number in the future. Actually, history shows us that that has been the case since census begun. The reality is that... sorry...

**The Chief Minister:**

But not the same rapid increase. Let us not try and...

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

The reality, Chief Minister, is that the overall population is increasing at the thousands...

**The Chief Minister:**

You have spent 10 minutes making assertions which are...even if we accepted, and it is a detail that you would not expect us to have, the Chairman's assertion about needing more procedures, there is still...if you have got fewer working people, you have got more people who are retired and over 65, that presents challenges to you right across the community, whether or not you accept the issue about their health need. You have got fewer earning people so you have got less tax, you have got potentially different types of accommodation that you need to consider. You have got the benefits that you need to provide for. So...

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Yes, but you are assuming that...

**The Chief Minister:**

...these are issues which are coming out of an ageing population.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Yes, but you are assuming that they are all going to give up work at retirement age and sit there knitting and doing the garden. Is that a fair assumption of our current oldies?

**The Chief Minister:**

No, we are not assuming that at all. No, we are not assuming that at all, which is why I brought forward, when I was Minister for Social Security, an increase in pensionable age and tying it to the increase longevity which we have seen from 2010. So we are not assuming that at all.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

I will try and keep the questions short and to the point and then hopefully we can get short answers. Can you confirm that the population has been and is increasing at 1,000 a year?

**The Chief Minister:**

You would have to have support of those details, that is not what...

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Surely, it is not rocket science.

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

The average level of net immigration over the last 3 years is plus 600 not plus 1,000.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Okay, what did the census show us?

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

Well, it depends what timeframe you are talking about. If we talk about 2006 to 2008...

**The Chief Minister:**

You are just picking a random date to try and make the point.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

No, okay, I will ask another question so that it is easy for you to answer. Can you confirm that population has increased 1,000 a year during the period of the last census?

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

Yes.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

What is the average increase since 2011 to now?

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

The average from 2010 to now, I do not know from 2011 to now, is plus 600.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Plus 600, and the natural growth over that same period would be?

**The Chief Minister:**

Are you going to congratulate us that the policy appears to be working?

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

The natural growth over that same period, please?

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

I cannot recall, I am afraid.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Is it not correct that the natural growth is somewhere in the region of 400 per annum?

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

That would sound approximately correct.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Could you confirm that out of that average of 1,000 per year between the period of the census, over a 10 year period, and over the last 3 years, that generally the age of the individuals is not simply on the over 65s?

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

Most migrants are of working age.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

It is over the whole age range?

**The Chief Minister:**

Of course there are increases over...because you are saying 400 of those 600 were new births?

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Okay, so, Minister, I will then put to you...

**The Chief Minister:**

But what has that got to do with the age of the population that is currently here that is behind that increase? It does not have anything to do with it, does it?

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Because at the moment mention has been made of managing and providing for an ageing population but actually it is more significant than that because figures show us, and you have confirmed, that we have a growing population, which is why in part that the number of people over 65 will continue to grow because as your population grows...

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

Let me be clear on the statistics. Under any immigration scenario over 65 population doubles, on a plus 500 net immigration scenario working age population stays the same. You have to have a high net immigration to increase the working age population under the Statistics Unit model, which we clearly rely on.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Except we are going to have a growing working population because look at the way our primary schools are expanding.

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

There is a changing profile of children but this is not immigration...

**The Chief Minister:**

But again if you would like to, and I know you have in the past, meet with the independent Statistics Unit that can give you the actual figure rather than just...

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

I think the actual figures for last year, rather than 600, was 900 and that was at a time when you were enforcing and being tough on licences but that is another point.

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

That is because the Strategic Plan supported higher value immigration.



**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Yes, but our problem is not the higher value immigration...

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

The split in immigration in 2012 was 80 per cent high value compared to in 2010 20 per cent high value. By that I am just using the old parlance of comparing (j)s and non-locals. So the split has reversed in 3 years in terms of the type of immigration figures.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

Can we finish on the access to justice? Change the subject.

**The Chief Minister:**

Was that mentioned on your list of...

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

You are doing a review on that. Just wondered how that was progressing.

**The Chief Minister:**

No, we have not started the review. I will be lodging a proposition, I am not sure whether it will be tomorrow or Monday with the terms of reference and a proposed methodology for it.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

Do you anticipate you will be looking at the legal aid system?

**The Chief Minister:**

Absolutely.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

When do you think changes will be proposed?

**The Chief Minister:**

Are we deciding what the outcome might be before the review has started?

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

No, but you did just say in response to a previous questions that legal aid would change?

**The Chief Minister:**

I did not, I said it would be part of the review.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

When do you believe the outcome of the review will be known?

**The Chief Minister:**

I am proposing that there is an interim report from that review 6 months after the commencement. So 6 months from when the States agree it, providing they do agree it. Then a further report 12 months after that. So the first part will really be looking what our current process is, trying to detail it and all the area of just this so that we have a formalised record of it and then looking at areas that might need to change, where the work is needed and that will lead to more detailed work leading to the 12 month report.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

So, Minister, are you planning to bring a proposition to the States to ask the States to agree a review to take place?

**The Chief Minister:**

Yes.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Why follow that route in this case when in many other cases reviews are decided upon by Ministers and not brought to the States for debate?

**The Chief Minister:**

Well, there are 2 reasons: it is an important matter, it will not be completed in this electoral term, so it is important to have States approval for it so that the next Assembly or the next Council of Ministers have to carry on with. Secondly, Deputy Tadier has brought a proposition asking for that exactly to be the case because some Members may wish to amend the terms of reference or propose other people to sit on the advisory panel.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Do you think it is appropriate to be making decisions about funding of a liquid waste infrastructure prior to the States, or the Council of Ministers for that matter, considering the liquid waste strategy?

**The Chief Minister:**

Yes, because there are enabling works that need to take place.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

But what are you enabling?

**The Chief Minister:**

You are enabling a new facility in due course.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

But if you do not know the process you are going to use you cannot do enabling works.

**The Chief Minister:**

There are bits of kit that need to be moved...

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

No.

**The Chief Minister:**

Yes, there are. Whatever solution that you might want to provide for, there are works that need to be undertaken.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

So what you are saying is that the funds are being allocated and discussing the Budget are simply funds to maintain the current system rather than...

**The Chief Minister:**

No, to enable in due course a new system.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

£75 million was worth of new system enabling?

**The Chief Minister:**

That is not what is in the Budget. That is not what Members are being asked for.

**Chief Executive Officer:**

Regardless of which process or technology is adopted, there will have to be some more land within the Bellozanne confines made available for that to happen.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Well, it depends on the process.

**Chief Executive Officer:**

Exactly, so in order to free up that land...

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

You are either going to spread or you are going to be vertical.

**Chief Executive Officer:**

Can I finish? If you go vertical you still need the land to go vertical and that land is not available today so it has to be created. The only way it can be created is by diverting existing services and existing facilities at Bellozanne. Otherwise you will not be able to go vertical, there is no land to do it.

[11:30]

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

There is all that space near the...but anyway...

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

So it is not reliant...you are saying that the money that is involved and is going to be discussed in the Budget this for next year, the 2014 budget, is not part and parcel of what will support a liquid waste strategy in the future?

**The Chief Minister:**

It is money in the M.T.F.P.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

As well.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

It is going to enable certain groundworks to be done because whichever process we are going to use, am I right in thinking this, we do not have the ground available?

**Chief Executive Officer:**

The ground that is there is full of high voltage cables, for example, so they have to be diverted otherwise we have to go through 3,000, 11,000-odd cables. So all that has to be diverted just to create a piece of land in order to build whatever technology is selected.

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

So you are saying no new land has to be acquired, the land is there.

**Chief Executive Officer:**

Regardless of whichever technology at the moment is selected, there is no new land needed to be purchased separately. The existing land within the Bellozanne site is full of drains, high voltage cables, Jersey Electricity Company supply cables that feed part of the Island. In order to create an area that is clean for building, regardless of whether it is down, up, sideways, whichever way...

**Deputy R.J. Rondel:**

Regardless of what system?

**Chief Executive Officer:**

Regardless of what system.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Right, oh well we will see, will we not? Thank you very much indeed, gentlemen.

**The Chief Minister:**

It has been a pleasure.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

I am so pleased.

**The Chief Minister:**

Thank you very much. Have a good rest of the day. See you outside later. I have a lot to do before I get to that point.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

It is, as I say, of the utmost importance that information is provided to us, especially with regards to the population. We do need to be able to spend some time considering the matter. It is all very well to wait until the Council of Ministers have considered it in depth.

**The Chief Minister:**

I think you should, if Paul can have a presentation in short order of what we...

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

I think first of all it would be nice to have a presentation but there is nothing better than for us to consider written evidence.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Can we have the papers?

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

Yes.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

Then our meetings, briefings and presentations will be far more focused.

**Assistant Chief Minister:**

It was really just to offer what the Council of Ministers went through yesterday.

**The Deputy of St. Ouen:**

It was a slideshow, was it?

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

Yes.

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Death by PowerPoint.

**Director, Corporate Policy:**

Not quite.

**The Chief Minister:**

Where is your new Member, is she okay?

**Senator S.C. Ferguson:**

Yes, she had a prior engagement this morning.

[11:33]